



Doc. 11535
20 March 2008

Observation of the Parliamentary Elections in Monaco (3 February 2008)

Report¹
Ad hoc Committee of the Bureau of the Assembly
Rapporteur: Mr Jaakko LAAKSO, Finland, Group of the Unified European Left

Contents

- I. Introduction
- II. The Pre-Election Period
- III. Election Day
- IV. Results of the ballot
- V. Conclusions
- VI. Recommendations

I. Introduction

1. In response to an invitation from the Minister of State of Monaco, Mr Jean-Paul Proust, the Bureau of the Parliamentary Assembly decided, on 22 November 2007, to set up an ad hoc committee to observe the elections to the National Council (Parliament) of Monaco, which took place on 3 February 2008.

2. Based on the proposals of the Assembly's political groups, the ad hoc committee was composed as follows:

Socialist Group (SOC)

Mr Leonid Slutsky, Russian Federation

Group of the European People's Party (EPP/CD)

Mr Egidius Vareikis, Lithuania

Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe (ALDE)

Mr Maximilian Reimann, Switzerland

¹ Approved by the Bureau at its meeting on 13 March 2008.

European Democrat Group (EDG)

Baroness Gloria Hooper, United Kingdom

Group of the Unified European Left (UEL)

Mr Jaakko Laakso, Finland

3. The Bureau appointed me as Head of this ad hoc committee.
4. Secretariat support was provided by Mr Vladimir DRONOV, Head of Secretariat, Interparliamentary Cooperation Department and Ms Farida JAMAL, Administrative Assistant.
5. The ad hoc committee met in Monaco from 1 to 4 February.
6. In addition to observing the actual voting and vote count, committee members met with Monegasque party leaders, the President of the National Council, the Minister of State, as well as the Mayor of Monaco, who is also Chair of the Electoral Committee. The Committee's work programme is reproduced in Appendix 1. On Election Day, the Committee observed the actual voting in Monaco's only polling station, the vote count following the closure of voting and visited the Government Election monitoring unit. The text of the press statement made following this observation exercise can be found in Appendix 2. The PACE delegation was the only international delegation to observe the 3 February elections.
7. The Election Day was characterised by a high voter turnout (76.85 % - 4854 Monegasques voted out of a total of 6316 registered voters) and was in general calm. The electoral officials displayed remarkable efficiency and professionalism. The vote count was conducted effectively and in full compliance with existing regulations. It was carried out in a unique atmosphere of transparency where every national of Monaco could observe the process.
8. The delegation wishes to thank the Parliament of Monaco (national Council) and the Office of the Minister of State for their co-operation and for the logistical support provided to the ad hoc committee.

II. The Pre-Election Period

Legal framework and electoral administration

9. Following its accession to the Council of Europe in 2004, Monaco has yet to ratify the first additional Protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) that safeguards, *inter alia*, the right to free elections.
10. Under the existing legislation, the Parliament is elected for a term of five years, in a single round mixed majority/proportional election. Two-thirds (18 members) of the National Council are appointed by majority vote, and go to those who have obtained the most of votes. The remainder (8 seats) are filled by proportional vote based on the highest-average rule provided that the candidates from a list which has obtained at least 5 % of the votes.
11. According to the Election Law, the administration of the election process is organised by the Office of the Mayor of Monaco, with the Mayor acting as Chair of the Electoral Committee.

Voters and Candidates

12. All Monegasque nationals who are 18 and above are eligible to vote. Only nationals of Monaco (including naturalised Monegasques) are entitled to stand in an election. To exercise the right to vote, a person has to present himself/herself at the country's only polling station, produce an identity card and a voter's card. Existing legislation does not provide for voting by postal correspondence, mail-in voting or voting in the few Monegasque embassies abroad. People in hospitals could also be disenfranchised as the procedure does not provide for mobile ballot boxes. However, to take care of these situations, the law allows voting by proxy.
13. Candidates belonging to three lists ran in these elections: Union Pour Monaco (UPM), Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco (REPM) and Monaco Ensemble (ME). In accordance with Monaco's

legislation that provides for mixing candidates during the vote, in addition to voting for the lists, voters could vote for individual candidates from different lists (see paragraph 10, above).

The run-up to the election and the election campaign

14. The election campaign was low-key. Since traditionally no opinion polls were conducted the outcome of the election was rather unclear even to the political elite.

15. In a welcome development, the Office of the Mayor conducted a voters' awareness - raising campaign, producing booklets and posters that clarified the rather complicated voting procedures in Monaco's mixed system.

16. The delegation was informed by some interlocutors that there was a degree of discontent in the Monegasque electorate due to the belated publication of political programmes of the stakeholders which, allegedly, did not allow the electorate to obtain a full picture of the different political platforms. There were mutual recriminations across the three lists lamenting the unwillingness of their leaders to engage in public debate. Local media published information concerning financial resources, collected by political lists, as well the use of those funds.

The media

17. Monaco has no legislation governing media behaviour in an electoral campaign. In general, in the absence of specific legislation, coverage of the electoral campaign by the media was pluralistic. The media sought to observe equal allocation of attention to the three contesting camps, even though no law in Monaco requires them to do so.

III. Election Day

18. PACE observers were able to obtain a comprehensive picture of the voting and the vote count. The elections were well organised and conducted in an orderly manner. The delegation regarded the administration of the elections as exemplary.

19. The vote count was an exercise in an extraordinary transparency, by international standards, with a significant proportion of Monegasque nationals present.

IV. Results of the ballot

20. The results of the ballot (see Appendix 3) produced a parliament composed of members of two of the three lists that ran in the elections, with UMP obtaining 21 out of the 24 seats and REPM getting 3 seats.

V. Conclusions

21. The ad hoc committee agreed that, given the particular situation of Monaco, the election was largely in line with Council of Europe electoral standards. The Electoral commission conducted its work in an impartial and professional manner, displaying great transparency and efficiency.

22. The ad hoc committee considers that the results of the elections are indicative of massive support by the Monegasques for the reforms conducted by the State. This should encourage the authorities to continue working towards full implementation of Monaco's commitments *vis-à-vis* the Council of Europe, including the ratification of the first additional Protocol to the ECHR.

23. The ad hoc committee is confident that these elections mark an important milestone along the road of Monaco's further integration into the Council of Europe.

VI. Recommendations

24. While no problems have been reported concerning media behaviour, the Monegasque authorities should consider introducing new media legislation that would, *inter alia*, specifically address media behaviour during the electoral campaign.

25. The ad hoc committee reiterates the Assembly recommendation inviting the Monegasque authorities to reflect on the need to adopt a law on political parties, not least with a view to ensuring the transparency of party funding.

APPENDIX 1

Ad hoc Committee for the Observation of the parliamentary elections in Monaco 1 - 4 February

Programme

Place : Columbus Hôtel Monaco

Friday 1 February 2008

- | | |
|-------|--|
| 09h45 | Meeting of the ad hoc committee (Lobby of the Hotel) |
| 10h00 | <i>Departure from the hotel</i> |
| 10h30 | Meeting with Mr Georges MARSAN, Mayor of Monaco |
| 12h30 | Lunch |
| 15h00 | Meeting with Mr Jean-Paul PROUST, Minister of State |
| 16h00 | Meeting with Mr. Philippe NARMINO, Director of the Judicial Services |
| 17h00 | Meeting with the Media representatives |

Saturday 2 February 2008

- | | |
|-------|---|
| 10h30 | <i>Departure from the Hotel</i> |
| 11h00 | Meeting with Mr Stéphane VALERI, President of the National Council, |
| 12h30 | Working Lunch with the members of the PACE delegation |

Meetings with different lists of political parties

- | | |
|-------|--|
| 14h30 | List « Monaco Ensemble » |
| 16h00 | List « Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco » |
| 17h30 | List « Union Pour Monaco » |
| 18h30 | Return to the Hotel |

Sunday 3 February 2008

(Assisted by the Directorate of Diplomatic Relations)

- | | |
|-------------------|--|
| 09h00 full day | Observation of Voting at the Salle du Canton (Polling station) |
| 21h00 | Counting of the votes at the Salle du Canton |

Monday 4 February 2008

Departures

APPENDIX 2

Monaco elections were free and fair, say Assembly Observers

Strasbourg, 04.02.2008 – The 3 February 2008 parliamentary elections in Monaco were free and fair. They were well organised and their result is a true expression of the will of the electorate, concluded a five-member, cross-party delegation of observers from the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE).

The delegation was impressed with the high voter turnout of 77 per cent, which testifies to the confidence of Monegasques that every vote counts. This public mood bodes well for the future of representative democracy in this particular constitutional monarchy.

The elections were competitive: the electorate was able to choose from three lists reflecting various shades and colours of the political spectrum. The elections set a good example for the Council of Europe in terms of holding free, fair and well administered elections.

The Office of the Mayor of Monaco, in its capacity of election administrator, has done a commendable job in awareness-raising in the run-up to the elections. The vote-count was an exercise in efficiency and unprecedented openness for all.

Naturally, even in good elections there is always scope for improvement. The early publication of political programmes would have ensured timely and full information for voters with regard to the political plans of the contestants. Public debates would have helped the electorate to acquire a better understanding of the three platforms.

On the whole, these elections marked a step forward towards Monaco's full compliance with its obligations and commitments as a Council of Europe member state.

The delegation,² led by Jaakko Laakso (Finland, UEL), was in Monaco at the invitation of Jean-Paul Proust, Minister of State of Monaco. It held discussions, among others, with the Minister of State, the Mayor of Monaco, representatives of the three lists of candidates, Monaco's PACE delegation, and a cross-section of the media.

The delegation wishes to thank the offices of the Minister of State and the Mayor of Monaco, as well as the National Council, for their excellent co-operation in the organisation of the visit.

Contact:

Monaco: Vladimir Dronov, Interparliamentary Co-operation and Election Observation Service, mobile +33(0)6 63 49 37 92.

Strasbourg: Parliamentary Assembly Communication Unit, tel. +33 (0)3 88 41 31 93.

². The members of the delegation were Jaakko Laakso (Finland, UEL), head of delegation, Leonid Slutsky (Russian Federation, SOC), Egidijus Vareikis (Lithuania, EPP/CD), Maximilian Reimann (Switzerland, ALDE) and Baroness Gloria Hooper (United Kingdom, EDG).

APPENDIX 3

Results - National Elections 2008

| | |
|------------|---------|
| Registered | 6316 |
| Voters | 4854 |
| Turnout | 76.85 % |
| Blank | 80 |
| Invalid | 124 |

First-past-the-post system

| Elected | Lists | Number of votes |
|------------------------------|-------------------|-----------------|
| • ROBILLON Jean-François | Union Pour Monaco | 2403 |
| • FAUTRIER Catherine | Union Pour Monaco | 2383 |
| • NOTARI Fabrice | Union Pour Monaco | 2327 |
| • BORDERO Alexandre | Union Pour Monaco | 2319 |
| • DITTLOT Michèle | Union Pour Monaco | 2313 |
| • SVARA Pierre | Union Pour Monaco | 2303 |
| • GARDETTO Jean-Charles S. | Union Pour Monaco | 2300 |
| • SPILOTIS-SAQUET Christophe | Union Pour Monaco | 2279 |
| • VALERI Stéphane | Union Pour Monaco | 2274 |
| • CLERISSI Philippe | Union Pour Monaco | 2266 |
| • LORENZI Pierre | Union Pour Monaco | 2261 |
| • POYARD-VATRICAN Anne | Union Pour Monaco | 2256 |
| • BERTRAND Gérard | Union Pour Monaco | 2247 |
| • BOCCONE-PAGES Brigitte | Union Pour Monaco | 2241 |
| • BOUHNİK-LAVAGNA Sophie | Union Pour Monaco | 2237 |
| • ROSE Guillaume | Union Pour Monaco | 2221 |

Proportional representation

| Elected | Lists | Number of votes |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------|
| • STEINER Christophe | Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco | 1838 |
| • BURINI Marc | Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco | 1798 |
| • NOUVION Laurent | Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco | 1793 |
| • MARQUET Bernard | Union Pour Monaco | 2184 |
| • CELLARIO Claude | Union Pour Monaco | 2167 |
| • MANZONE-SAQUET Nicole | Union Pour Monaco | 2133 |
| • GUAZZONNE Eric | Union Pour Monaco | 2120 |
| • MARQUET Roland | Union Pour Monaco | 2101 |

Number of seats

| List | Number of seats | Number of votes |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Union Pour Monaco | 21 | 53523 |
| Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco | 3 | 41512 |
| Monaco Ensemble | 0 | 7491 |

LISTE « Union Pour Monaco »

| Candidates | Number of votes | Elected |
|-------------------------------|-----------------|---------|
| • ALESSANDRI Jessica | 2 079 | |
| • BATTAGLIA Maryse | 2 067 | |
| • BERTRAND Gérard | 2 247 | Elected |
| • BOCCONE-PAGES Brigitte | 2 241 | Elected |
| • BONNAL Isabelle | 2 042 | |
| • BORDERO Alexandre | 2 319 | Elected |
| • BOUHNİK-LAVAGNA Sophie | 2 237 | Elected |
| • CELLARIO Claude | 2 167 | Elected |
| • CLERISSI Philippe | 2 266 | Elected |
| • DITTLOT Michèle | 2 313 | Elected |
| • FAUTRIER Catherine | 2 383 | Elected |
| • GARDETTO Jean-Charles S. | 2 300 | Elected |
| • GUAZZONNE Eric | 2 120 | Elected |
| • LORENZI Pierre | 2 261 | Elected |
| • MANZONE-SAQUET Nicole | 2 133 | Elected |
| • MARQUET Bernard | 2 184 | Elected |
| • MARQUET Roland | 2 101 | Elected |
| • NOTARI Fabrice | 2 327 | Elected |
| • POYARD-VATRICAN Anne | 2 256 | Elected |
| • ROBILLON Jean-François | 2 403 | Elected |
| • ROSE Guillaume | 2 221 | Elected |
| • SPILIOTIS-SAQUET Christophe | 2 279 | Elected |
| • SVARA Pierre | 2 303 | Elected |
| • VALERI Stéphane | 2 274 | Elected |

LISTE « Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco »

| Candidates | Number of votes | Elected |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------|---------|
| • BARIA Guy | 1 709 | |
| • BERTI Christian | 1 658 | |
| • BLANCHY Jean-Baptiste | 1 764 | |
| • BOISSON Rainier | 1 757 | |
| • BURINI Marc | 1 798 | Elected |
| • CROVETTO Bertrand | 1 760 | |
| • DICK Georges | 1 673 | |
| • ELENA Martine | 1 689 | |
| • FICINI Alain | 1 722 | |
| • FRESKO-ROLFO Béatrice | 1 684 | |
| • GRIMAUD-PALMERO Patricia | 1 689 | |
| • KERN-de MILLO TERRAZZANI Elodie | 1 749 | |
| • LIBERATORE-VITTORIOSO Anne | 1 720 | |

| | | |
|------------------------------|-------|---------|
| • MAGNAN Guy | 1 733 | |
| • MULLOT Richard | 1 790 | |
| • NOGHES-MENIO Cristina | 1 641 | |
| • NOUVION Laurent | 1 793 | Elected |
| • POYET Thierry | 1 751 | |
| • PRAT Bernard | 1 720 | |
| • ROSTICHER Claude | 1 753 | |
| • STEINER Christophe | 1 838 | Elected |
| • TCHOBANIAN Joël | 1 719 | |
| • VACCAREZZA Claude | 1 702 | |
| • DE VEIGY-BROUSSE Géraldine | 1 700 | |

LISTE « Monaco Ensemble »

| Candidates | Number of votes | Elected |
|-----------------------------|-----------------|---------|
| • AGLIARDI Claudine | 378 | |
| • BOERI Daniel | 483 | |
| • BOISSON Claude | 654 | |
| • DICK Pierre | 398 | |
| • FERREYROLLES Franck | 429 | |
| • FERREYROLLES Guy-Philippe | 398 | |
| • GENINAZZA-BACHÉ Martine | 396 | |
| • GIORDANO René | 568 | |
| • LE JOLIFF Audrey | 437 | |
| • L'HERBON DE LUSSATS Jean | 395 | |
| • LICARI Jean-Pierre | 679 | |
| • MARESCHI Gabrielle | 392 | |
| • NIGIONI Jean-Luc | 583 | |
| • RIT Jacques | 830 | |
| • WOOLLEY Patrice | 471 | |